Cinderella in Ireland
Author(s): Reidar Th. Christiansen
Source: *Béaloideas*, Iml. 20, Uimh 1/2 (Jun. - Dec., 1950), pp. 96-107
Published by: An Cumann Le Béaloideas Éireann/The Folklore of Ireland Society
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/20521197
Accessed: 21/06/2014 02:43

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at
http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

An Cumann Le Béaloideas Éireann/The Folklore of Ireland Society is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Béaloideas.*

http://www.jstor.org

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

CINDERELLA IN IRELAND

THE recent appearance of a very thorough and capable monograph on the Cinderella Cycle (Anna Birgitta Rooth: *The Cinderella Cycle,* Lund, 1951) is the immediate occasion for adding a new instalment to a couple of earlier contributions towards a list of Irish Folktales.[1] At the same time, however, this very book offers new and striking evidence of the fact that as yet any list of Irish folktales is bound to be provisory, the versions in the manuscripts of the Folklore Commission being, probably, in every case much more numerous than those accessible in print. The author of the Cinderella book is well aware of the fact, and has been able, thanks to the collaboration of Irish folklorists, to use a very representative selection of Irish versions, among which are some 30 from manuscript sources, with the restriction, however, that only the introductory parts were known to her. Being more specially concerned with a few of the many redactions of the Cinderella novel, her list of versions was not intended to be complete. At all events, Irish folktales are in her book far better represented than they were in that of her famous precursor, *Cinderella,* written in 1893 by Marian Roalfe Cox,[2] in itself a great achievement with the 345 variants from every part of the world, summarized and systematically arranged according to the various redactions. Miss Cox's book will, therefore, always remain an indispensable preliminary to any further studies in this cycle, one of those most universally popular, so that during the 60 years since its appearance many times as many versions are on record.

The existence of such a monograph and the knowledge that not even an approximately complete list of Irish variants can be given, has tempted the present writer to add to his list of printed versions some further notes or speculations, upon possible connections with the variants from neighbouring countries, and has even taken him back to what may perhaps be called the crucial problem of folktale-studies: when is a parallel between variants a definite indication of borrowing, and when is the cause the regular development of the novel itself. Folktales are, after all, fiction on a very small scale, with rigid conventions and with a strange aversion from any individual psychology; but they still keep to the rule of having a good plot handled in a competent manner. A plot so simple and human as that of Cinderella, she has become the prototype of any

---

1 *Béaloideas* vii pp. 3-14, viii pp. 97-105.
2 *Cinderella.* London. Folk-Lore Society, 1893.

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

number of magazine-stories and films, has been taken up by the folktale in many ways, and there is endless opportunity for new combinations and borrowings.

The survey of the contents of Irish versions is prefaced by a list of the different motifs, with references added to each version.

AI. Step-mother motif.
- b. Ill-treatment of step-son (b1)—step-daughter (b2)
- c. who, with scanty provisions, is sent to herd cattle, but gets the assistance of a friendly bull (c1) or a sheep (c2)
- d. which is said, or implied to be, the deceased mother.
- e. There is a never failing supply of food, *etc.*, in the animal's horn (e1) or ear (e2)
- f. Step-mother is suspicious, step-sisters spy, two fail, nr. 3 has an extra eye.
- g. Someone else appears to help.

AII. a Step-mother asks for the life of the animal, feigns sickness (a1) only to be cured by blood, *etc.*
- b. She wants to get rid of step-child; question of inheritance.
- c. Flight of step-child and animal.

AIII. Three sisters live together, the third one is the household drudge.

B. The woods or pastures of the giants (comp. Dragon-Slayer).

BI. Forbidden to touch leaves, fruits, *etc.*

2. Tabu broken, the bull has to fight another bull.

C. Helpful animal killed
- 1. Skinned, strip of skin preserves magic powers.
- 2. Bones buried.
- 3. Tree sprouting from grave.

D1. Step-mother plots the destruction of heroine.

2. Accuses her of being pregnant, tests applied.

DII. The heroine escapes
- b. assisted by step-sisters
- c. a wise woman
- d. she is bewitched.

E. Her further adventures.
- 1. She is saved, an animal being killed instead.
- 2. Disguised in skin or rushes, engaged as servant at the royal castle.
- 3. The prince's tests for his prospective bride.
- 4. Her enigmatic answers when asked for her home, *etc.*

F. The incest-motif.

I. king pledged to marry the one who fitted ring, *etc.*
- b. daughter tries it on.
- c. Is discovered by father, who orders her to marry him.

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

II. The good advice
a given by dead mother:
b To ask for three costly dresses, various colours, gold,
c. The third one to be of glass.
d. Asks for a box, a golden horse, hides in it herself, with dresses.
e. Box bought by prince.
f. Engaged as servant (comp. E2).
Prince sees her by chance in her fine dress.
h. Provided with horse and coach.

G. The festival. (a1) a ball. (a2) Mass. (a3) market, races.
4 steps taken to delay her, scatter peas, *etc.*
b. She makes an animal (cat) do her work.
c. Her three visits to . . .
d. She loses shoe or slipper.
e. The shoe test.
f. mutilated feet—" nippit feet "—
g. animals reveal where she is hidden.

H. The End. Wedding.
I. The dead mother restored to life.
II. Step-mother is punished.
III. The prince cannot find the unknown, breaks down, cured by cake (drink). ring, token of recognition.
b. He plans to marry someone else, tests.
IV. The Wedding.

. . . . . .

Antrim. Fionnghuala ceathair cráin. Rathlin Island. *Sgéaltan Rachreann*, Aoidhmin Mac Gréagóir. Dublin, 1910, p. 19. Introd. diff.: Three sisters go in turn to get firewood, only nr. 3 complies with certain regulations and is promised assistance: G a2 d e g-H lv.

Cork. (1) Coateen of the Rushes. Ráth Luirc (Charleville). Rec. 1930 by Áine Ní Chróinín; reciter, Patrick McAuliffe, who heard it from his father, an Irish speaker. Co. Limerick, Pr. *Béaloideas* ii, p. 368: —F 1 a (glass-slipper) b c II a b (the colour of every bird, etc.—fled. f (E2)—G a1 c (dead mother)—H III b. IV.

(2) An Leas-mhac agus an tarbh. Rec. Conchubhar Ó Muimhneacháin, Béal Átha an Ghaorthaidh, 1901, pr. *Imtheachta an Oireachtais* 1901. II 1. *Fionn agus Lorcán*. p. 26. —A1 b1 c c1 e 1 f A II a1 c—B 2 C 1—B continuation. Dragon Fight.

(3) Móirín. Rec. Conchubhar Ó Deasúmhna. Ballymakeera, pr. 1900. Edit. Douglas Hyde: *Imtheachta an Oireachtais*. *Tri*

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Sgéalta p. 1—A III. The two sisters agree to kill their mother. C 2 (cat comes out of grave—E 2 (herd the geese) 4-G a3 d e g (cat) H iv. Continuation: Aa Th 403.

(4) Tairbhín Liam. Told by Domhnall Ua Deasmhúmhna, Ballymakeera. Ed. J. Lloyd. *Imtheachta an Oireachtais* 1901 III *Madra na n-Ocht gCos* p. 59—A 1 b1 c c1 d (asked that boy and bull should never be separated) f e A II a a1 c—to a castle where a princess is to be won—hiding-contest; comp. Aa Th 507. Note that the bull is accidentally transformed into a horse.

Donegal. Billy Beg and the Bull. Seumas Mac Manus, *In Chimney Corners* p. 1. Listed as Aa. Th. 300 Donegal 4 (*Béaloideas* vii) A1 b1 c1 d1 (her last wish was that boy and bull should be kept together) e 2 (napkin) stick sword). A II a c-B 2 (A1 e2) continuation: Dragon slayer. Note shoe test—in recognition of hero.

Galway. (1) An bhean uasal agus an ollphéist. Rec. Douglas Hyde, 1896, from Mártan Ruadh Ó Giollarnáth, Muine Beith, Athenry. Pr. *Béaloideas* I p. 366.—A1b2 c 2 (transformed by a wise woman c c2-G a2 c d e continuation: story akin to Aa. Th 403. (child stolen by monster, *etc.*).

(2) Cóitín Luachra. Rec. Seán Mac Giollarnáth from Micheál Mac Donnchadha, 1930. Cárna. Pr. *Béaloideas* ii, p. 333.—F1 a1 (ring) b c (" nach bochd an sgéal é sin ") II a b d f—coat of rushes—G a (dead mother) d e-H iv.

(3) Craicinnín. Rec. Seósamh Ó Flannagáin from Seán Ó Flathartaigh, 1931. Aran Islands. Pr. *Béaloideas* ix 75—F, no test, just ordered her to marry him. II—no special advice, asked for dresses and magic stick d- (to Domhan Toir f (E 2)—G a2 c slaithín arranged everything c d e-H a iv.

(There is a reference (*Béaloideas* iii p. 274) to a version: Sgéal Sméid, rec. by Seán Mac Giollarnáth, Galway, published *Béaloideas* iii, pp. 342-8.) Aa. Th. 328.

Kerry. 1. Inghean Ríogh Éireann. Rec. J. Lloyd from a young lad in Ballyferriter. First pr. *Irisleabh na Gaedh*. vol. XII (1902); repr. *Tonn Tóime*, ed. J. Lloyd (1915), nr. xxxi p. 53.—F 1a (marriage previously arranged with a neighbouring prince) b c AII advice. d (hid in a golden horse). e (bought by prince). f (he saw her through the window, could not get in). H III a·IV.

2. Fair, Brown and Trembling. (Kerry?) J. Curtin. *Myths and Folklore of Ireland* (1890) p. 78. Repr. Jacobs. *Celtic Fairy Tales* (1892) p. 169—A III (for seven years) A1g (the hen-wife) G 2 a2 (elaborate dress—honey-birds, etc.) b c d f. Prince had to fight other champions to win her. continuation Aa. Th. 403.

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

3. No title. Rec. Ceann Tráigh. Pr. *An Lóchrann,* 1919. AIII: widow, two eldest daughters kill her, intend to kill third sister—G a2 4 (Little woman, i.e., mother) magic stick—glass slippers, king's son saw her—H iv.

4. Rí na Gréine agus bannríoghan na Gaoithe. Clochán Dubh. Rec. 1929 by "An Seabhac" from Bean Uí Mhaoileoin. Pr. *Béaloideas* ii p. 274.—A1 b2 Di 2 (activities of a sean-draoi), A II a1 (liver of the girl), D 11 F II f H III b-iv.—step-mother died, step-sister came to take her back.

5. Inghean na caerach duibhe. Rec. by "An Seabhac," Iveragh, 1930, from Séan Ó Muircheartaigh. Pr. *Béaloideas* iii p. 264. Dif.: King found a strange black sheep among his own—turned out to be a lady under a spell—woman by night, sheep by day.—daughter born.—A1 (step-sister) c2. e2. G a a3 d, hid under a basket. g (cat). continuation Aa. Th. 403.

6. An Tarbh Druíochta. Rec. Kenneth Jackson, Blasket Islands, 1933, from Peig Sayers. Entered as Aa. Th. 300 Kerry 10 (*Béaloideas* vii 12). Pr. *Béaloideas* iv 301.—A1. Last wish of mother: bull to be given to son. bl c e. AII a c. B continuation Aa. Th. 300.

7. *An caitín geara glas.* Rec. M. L. Sjoestedt-Jonval. The Blasket Islands, 1932, from Peig Sayers. Pr. *Rev. Celtique* xlix p. 406. Repr. *Béaloideas* viii p. 11. A1 (her mother left the king) b2 f (green cat) G a (son of the king of Connacht looking for a wife) a cd 1 (magic stick) d e. Continuation Aa. Th. 403.

8. *Béaloideas* ii 372, a reference to a version from Kerry, Cóitín Luachra, 1929. Taken down by Prof. Delargy.

Kilkenny. Ref. *Béaloideas* ii 372, to a version "Capall," rec. by Tobias Kavanagh.

Leitrim. Cul Fin, Cul Din, Cul Corrach. Rec. Leland L. Duncan, who heard it from a Roscommon man "who had very good Irish." Pr. Folklore v 203 (1894)—A III Widow—3 girls—sent in turn to borrow fire in the house of a witch—two misbehave—third acts in the right way—G a2 (dresses, etc., supplied by witch) c d (glass-slipper) e H iv.

Longford. The Story of the Little Red Bull. Rec. Pádraig Mac Gréine from James Martin, Drumderg, Ballinalee. Listed as Aa. Th. 300 Longford I. (*Béaloideas* vii)—A1 b1 c1 d ("the spirit of your mother is within me") e continuation 300.

Roscommon. 1. Cóitín Fathag. Rec. Seán Mac Diarmada from Mrs. Sarsfield, Caisleán Riabhach. Ed. Douglas Hyde, *Béaloideas* iiii 69 A 1 b2 f c c2 d AII c alone D1 cd EII E2 G a2 (a sheep) d e H iv.

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

2. An Tarbh breac. Rec. Douglas Hyde. Pr. *An Sgéaluidhe Gaedhealach*. Listed Aa. Th. 300 Roscommon (*Béaloideas* VII) A1 b1 c1 e AII B 2 c1, passes into Aa. Th. 300.

Tyrone. An Tarbh donn. Rec. Éamonn Ó Tuathaill (1929-30) from Eóin Ó Cianáin. Pr. *Sgéalta Mhuintir Luinigh* 1933. nr. viii p. 33—A1 b b2 e c (in ear) f A11 c3 E 2 king saw her getting provisions from animal's skin. H iv.

(*Waterford*. Ref. *Béaloideas* ii 273 ("Micil Ó Muirgheasa, story-teller, Coláiste na Rinne, has a version of the story which, so far as I know, is still unrecorded.")

Wexford. The Princess in the Cat-skins. Pr. P. Kennedy, *Fireside Stories of Ireland* (1870) p. 81—F a II (from a filly, "I am the fairy that watched over you" 2 (that would fit into a walnut) escape III a b. C a1 c—ring on finger. H iv.

Wicklow (Carlow). Cinderella. Rec. Pádraig Ó Tuathail, 1934, Pr. *Béaloideas* vii p. 65. Introd. from Aa. Th. 328 (King, three daughters, the third: Hairy Rouchie, etc., at King's castle. G a witch provides horse, etc. d e H iv.

Ulster. Ashy Pelt. Pr. *Folk-lore* vi p. 305—A1 b 2 a2 (from under a grey stone) h G a1 party c d (silken slipper) c e f g (Black ewe)—fragmentary.

According to Dr. Rooth, there are five main redactions of the Cinderella novel, easily recognized, but at the same time, to a large extent, influencing each other. The redactions are: *A* Aa Th 511—*AB*. The A story (herding, neglect helpful animal, dead mother, espying sisters, etc.), combined with the Cinderella story proper Aa Th. 510 A (i.e., the visits to ball, church, loss of shoe, test, etc.). This tale is redaction *B*, while *B1* denotes the story Aa. Th. 510 B—the king wanted to marry his daughter. To these four Dr. Rooth added a fifth—*C* with a boy as the chief actor, a substitution that led to an entirely new sequel, for which the details were as a rule borrowed from the tale of the Dragon Slayer. From the list of Irish printed versions, however provisory, some observations of a more general kind may be made. All redactions are represented, there is, in other words, no standard Irish Cinderella-story, neither can Irish variants have a common source. They form a definite West-European traditional group, where, as in other groups, a probably extremely complicated network of influences is the background. One may also note how an individual story-teller, Peg Sayers, knew two redactions, keeping them well apart (Kerry 6, 7). From the geographical distribution of the tales, no inference can as yet be drawn, but some indications of their affinities, their development and pedigree may come to light

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

through some observations on their relations to the versions of Scottish, Continental, English, and perhaps, Scandinavian stories.

It is a point well worth making, when Dr. Rooth stresses the importance of secondary episodes, of peculiar twists in the regular pattern as valuable indications in any comparison of variants, and a few parallels of this kind may be examined somewhat more closely.

A Kerry-story (5) has a strange introduction: A king is told that a strange black sheep insists on staying with his flock, and discovers, on going on inspection, that the sheep is a lady under a spell—a woman by night, a sheep by day. He falls in love with her, a daughter is born—the heroine of a regular Cinderella story.

The only parallel known to me is a Scottish-Gaelic story, recorded in 1886 by Kenneth Macleod somewhere in Inverness-shire (Cox, p. 534). In this it is stated that a king had a daughter by a sheep and also a wife and children. Apart from this introductory episode, there is no striking similarity between the versions, both being fairly regular specimens of the type *B*, and only the Irish story has the continuation. A. Nutt added a few notes to the Scottish tale, pointing out that it had a special interest in stating "the animal parentage of the heroine in most uncompromising form." His words seem to imply that we have in this version a strangely primitive expression of what was the original conception behind the tale, but this is evidently a misconception, as in the plot of the Cinderella stories, the heroine is never of "animal parentage." The animal shape, usually that of a sheep, was assumed by her deceased mother to protect her daughter: a fact accepted without any comment by the folktale, even if a recent, more sophisticated reciter felt bound to make the sheep explain: "The spirit of your mother is within me" (Longford). A possible solution that may very well have occurred both to the Irish and the Scottish storyteller independently, was that the animal shape was the result of some spell of an earlier date; but this involves the storytellers in difficulties in arranging their pattern—lapse of years, *etc*. The fact, however, that the abrupt statement of the Scottish version seems silly and unintelligible except explained by the account of the Irish story, seems to presuppose that there is some direct connection between the two variants. And, as numerous other parallels establish the intimate relations between Scottish and Irish tales beyond doubt, the use of this strange motif may be classed as further evidence.

From Scotland some nine versions of the Cinderella-story were recorded (see J. Jacobs, *More English Fairytales*, 1894, p. 233, with references to the summaries given by Miss Cox). To these another one may be added, taken down in 1930 in the island of

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

Barra (*Béaloideas* vi, 297), representing the sub-type *B1*: Father wants to marry his own daughter, she escapes by the aid of a brown calf, then comes to a castle, with a regular Cinderella-episode as the sequel. There is a neat rendering in Gaelic of the stanza sung by the bird commenting upon the wrong person using the shoe. The redaction B1 is found in at least two other Scottish versions, the one from Islay (Campbell: PTWH); in another one (Chambers: Pop. Rhymes) the incident is toned down in the way that the heroine objects to a suitor proposed by her father. The close relationship between Irish and Scottish variants is apparent, but the sharp distinction drawn by J. Jacobs (p. 234) between a special English and a Gaelic (resp. Irish) Cinderella-type is untenable. The sub-types and the individual motifs are constantly combined in new ways, making it impossible to determine what is a special national type of an ubiquitous folktale of this kind. So much is, however, evident that there is, within England, Scotland and Ireland, a general agreement as to the way this story is told, and traces occur, even in Irish tradition, of an English chapbook-version at least a couple of centuries old.

There is, further, a rather peculiar introduction found in two North-Irish variants (Antrim and Leitrim): Three sisters are in turn sent to borrow firewood (or fire) in the house of an old woman (a witch or the Hen-wife). Two sisters misbehave, the third sister acts in the right way and gets her reward. In the Antrim story she consented to comb the hair of the witch, while, according to the other version, the girls were left alone at a kind of counter, where lay heaps of gold and silver. The pretty sisters helped themselves freely, the third did not touch a coin, and not only got the fire she wanted, but also later, in the Cinderella episode, the assistance needed to win the prince. Both tales probably had a common source. Strangely enough, this particular introduction is found only here and in an Icelandic version (Cox, Nr. 273), where, as in Irish, the girls were sent to borrow fire. The setting is different. They are challenged by a voice on passing a hill, encounter animals in a cave; in other words, the parallel is restricted to the opening scene. The explanation seems to be that in Iceland and in Ireland some storyteller opened his story with what may be called "The Kind and Unkind Motif," regularly associated with such kindred tales as "The Black and the White Bride" (Aa. Th. 403) or "The Spinning Women by the Well" (Aa. Th. 480), both very often combined with the Cinderella pattern. The coincidence, accordingly, does not offer any hint of a connection, and one is left with the impression that with regard to the Cinderella-cycle, the various redactions current in England, Scotland, and in Western Europe generally have passed to Ireland

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

through English intermediaries, the Irish versions forming the western limit in the migrations of the story.

There are, however, some possible indications of connection with redactions current in Southern Europe. The one most striking is the development of the plot in a version from Co. Cork (3) and in one from Kerry (3). Cinderella is the household drudge, living with two lazy sisters and an old mother. The two sisters kill their mother, while Cinderella escapes, being, however, under the constant protection of her mother. This introduction is, to the best of my knowledge, unknown in England and Scotland, but is common in versions from Spain and Italy. Probably, not even a detailed analysis of the material at hand could be expected to yield convincing proof of an actual connection, but we have at least another striking instance of how narrow is the circle of episodes from which oral tradition builds its compositions, with the result that identical passages unexpectedly occur in places far apart. One could also point to the use of a " magic stick," which simplifies the arrangement and selection of fairy-gifts. It is almost exclusively used in modern Spanish variants. Irish folktales of various types have it, and the motif is perhaps better explained as a modern innovation and simplification than as an indication of borrowing.

The question of the provenance of the Irish Cinderella stories can, accordingly—at least as yet—only be answered in very vague terms. There is, however, one redaction. Dr. Rooth's C, that has a less wide circulation, and its migrations might possibly be followed. In the list given above the redaction is represented by seven versions, but to judge from the references given by Dr. Rooth to Irish variants in manuscript, there are at least five or six times as many on record. A storyteller, Peig Sayers, knew both this redaction and the regular Cinderella-tale, keeping them well part. The title is constant, referring always to the bull,[3] and the versions are remarkably uniform, stressing more or less explicitly the connection between the hero's mother and the bull (Death-bed promise, Longford—" The spirit of your mother is within me ").

One might question whether it is right to class this redaction as a sub-type of the Cinderella cycle, in other words, whether it was originally developed out of this particular pattern. Such a development could be easily explained, as all the changes are due to the substitution of a male hero for a female, a step-son instead

---

[3] Cork 2: An Leas-mhac agus an Tarbh. 4, Tairbhín Liam. Don. Billy Beg and the Bull. Kerry 6: An Tarbh Draoidheachta. Longford. The Little Red Bulll. Rosc. An Tarbh Breac. Tyrone. An Tarbh Donn.

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

of a step-daughter. In other cycles such substitutions can be made without changing the tenor of the tale, as, *e.g.*, in the story of the Boy Who Stole the Giant's Treasures (Aa. Th. 328), but the Cinderella episode (ball-lost slipper) could not possibly be told with a boy as the chief actor. His final success could not depend upon innocence and beauty, but upon some feat of championship; in other words, the latter part had to be altered, and it was in Irish tradition usually borrowed from the equally ubiquitous tale of the Dragon-slayer. One might, accordingly, equally well class this composition as a sub-type of that cycle.

The question of classification is of minor interest, the point is rather that a new distinct tale emerged from the combination of two different plots. But the constant—the dominating—element is the first part, up to the killing of the helpful bull. The second part varies from country to country, is generally borrowed from some other cycle, and there was a wide choice, as what was wanted was only the final success and reward of the hero.

Looking over some of the versions referred to by Dr. Rooth and by Bolte-Polivka (Vol. III, p. 65), there are a couple of variants where an Irish background seems probable. One is a story recorded in 1915 in Canada: *Le dragon de feu,* told in French, but with exactly the same series of events as in Irish tales, and also with passages that have a decidedly Irish ring.[4] There is, *e.g.*, the giant's boast as the boy entered his pastures: "I had reckoned on two (pigs), but now I shall have three!"; and the way of killing the giant by pushing him down into the earth to the shoulders, *etc.* The first part, combined with another tale altogether, occurs also in a story from the Canadian Indians. An Irish origin seems equally certain in the case of an English Gypsy tale, The Little Bull, which is, however, much worn down.[5]

Classing these two variants with the Irish stories, the rest of the materials listed seems to show that in Europe the redaction C is known in the Balkans, in Ireland and in the Scandinavian countries. A series of Balkan tales have the same combination of a first part, remarkably well preserved, and a changing second part, where new episodes and motifs are used. A few variants from India have the same characteristics. As for the first part of the story, which, apart from the introduction of a male hero, evidently belongs to the Cinderella-cycle, there must be some connection between these traditional groups, and the theory proposed by Dr. Rooth of a spreading of the story from South-eastern Europe towards the north seems probable, not, however, through a slow,

---

[4] *J. Am. Folklore* 29, 31.

[5] F. Hindes Groome. *Gypsy Folk-Tales* p. 205.

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

gradual transmission, but rather through some chance intermediary, a book or, perhaps rather, a chance traveller. A closer relationship seems to exist between the Irish tales and the Scandinavian versions. It is strange that no Scottish-Gaelic version seems to be recorded; but as perhaps the greater part of Gaelic tales is still buried in manuscripts, a statement of this kind must be hedged round with every kind of reservation. There may be a reminiscence in a Scottish story from Aberdeenshire (Cox 35), where the heroine fled on the back of a calf; and in a kindred story from Moray (Cox 93), both probably having a common source. Both, however, revert to the regular Cinderella-pattern.

The Scandinavian versions are few in number and have some interesting features. One first notes the surprising popularity of this particular redaction in Iceland. An editor (Rittershaus) adds that the collections consulted for parallels offered none, *i.e.*, to the story as a whole. In Sveinsson's list of Icelandic tales (FFC 83) some nine variants are listed, all told more or less freely in the manner so common to most Icelandic tales, but with the main lines of the story intact. The second part was in most cases taken from the story of the Hidden Life (Aa. Th. 302), but there were at least two or three that used the plot of the Dragon-fight, as did the Irish variants. One may also note that the regular, international Cinderella-story does not seem ever to have been popular in Iceland; there is instead a peculiarly Icelandic redaction, and this may be read as evidence that to Icelandic storytellers the C redaction was in no way associated with the Cinderella-cycle.

In Norway, on the other hand, the continental Cinderella-tale gained a considerable popularity, with some 50 variants on record, while the C redaction is only represented by three versions. Two of these (Cox 319, 336) were taken down about a hundred years ago in an East-Norwegian valley, and their main contents may be indicated by using the key prefaced to the Irish tales.

GN 1 (Cox 319). Background: Brother and sister captured by a troll—A1 b1 c e1 AII ac.—the three metal-woods, not to break a twig—fight. The second part is the Glass-mountain story (Aa. Th. 530), and the Hide and Seek game (Aa. Th. 507). The second version is closely related and has the same ending. The third variant, from Western Norway (Cox 220), was also recorded about 1850, and presents some interesting points. The contents are: A1 b1—a sheep, killed, but a bull appears as protector of the boy. The metal-woods-tabu against breaking anything and against calling the bull by name. The conclusion is rather awkward. The treasures taken from the woods duly impressed the king and induced him to accept the boy as his son-in-law. One has the impression that the storyteller, perhaps unconsciously, had two

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions

different patterns in mind. He had both sheep (comp. Scottish and Irish tales) and bull. He had two tabus, and he did not succeed in bringing his composition to an effective conclusion.

One fact is at least obvious. This particular redaction is infinitely more open to innovations than the Cinderella story proper, and not only is the second half taken from various other cycles, but individual motifs as, *e.g.*, the metal woods have their proper place elsewhere, as in tales about the horse as a helper. In a Swedish story from Gotland (Säve 24), probably of Danish extraction, there is a reminiscence, as the heroine fled riding on a calf. In Danish tradition several redactions have preserved the pattern of the first half, some passing on to the Glass-mountain story, suggesting that two of the Norwegian versions may be of Danish origin.

How, then, to explain this criss-cross of parallels and variations within the relatively small group of North-West European tradition? What is sought is not a purely theoretical solution with its net of imaginary connecting lines, but an explanation that fits naturally into the geographical-historical milieu. A few general observations may be risked. All variants coming from Western Scandinavia, Ireland, Iceland, Norway, Jutland, suggest an intercourse across the sea. Only in Iceland and in Ireland can the redaction be said to have been popular, but even there varying sequels were combined with the first part, which is complicated enough to serve as a traditional nucleus, calling, however, for a satisfying conclusion. The first part did somehow belong to the Cinderella-cycle, and the necessity for having a new sequel, sprang, as mentioned before, from the introduction of a male hero, and in this case it seems likely that the idea of such a substitution, and not the finished composition, has spread from Ireland to Iceland. When and how is probably impossible to ascertain. It is fatally easy to refer to the contacts of Viking times, but the transfer **may** have happened then. But in this case, no constant inter-communication was needed, any traveller could have served as an intermediary. Further materials, a more detailed analysis, may help in fixing the date, but to my mind the possibility of reaching any definite, convincing answer is infinitely small, as all details of men as of daily life during the centuries along the coast of these northern waters have left no trace whatever in written records.

REIDAR TH. CHRISTIANSEN.

Oslo.

This content downloaded from 188.72.126.41 on Sat, 21 Jun 2014 02:43:22 AM
All use subject to JSTOR Terms and Conditions